

Question:

A regression model $\mathbf{y} = \mathbf{X}\boldsymbol{\beta} + \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}$, where $\mathbf{X} = [\mathbf{x}_1 \quad \mathbf{x}_2]$; $\mathbf{x}_i = (x_{i1} \ x_{i2} \ \cdots \ x_{in})^T, i=1,2$

are standardized with $\sum_{j=1}^n x_{ij} = 0$ and $\sum_{j=1}^n x_{ij}^2 = n$. Derive a condition of ρ s.t.

$$\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}^0\|^2 \leq \|\hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}\|^2, \text{ where } \hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}} = \frac{1}{n-n\rho} \begin{bmatrix} \langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle - \rho \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle \\ \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle - \rho \langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle \end{bmatrix}, \hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}^0 = \hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}|_{\rho=0} = \frac{1}{n} \begin{bmatrix} \langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle \\ \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle \end{bmatrix} \text{ and}$$

$$\rho = \frac{\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{x}_2 \rangle}{n}.$$

Solution:

$$\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}^0\|^2 = \frac{1}{n^2} (\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2 + \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2)$$

$$\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}\|^2 = \frac{1}{n^2(1-\rho^2)^2} \left\{ (\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle - \rho \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle)^2 + (\langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle - \rho \langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle)^2 \right\}$$

$$= \frac{1}{n^2(1-\rho^2)^2} \left\{ (1+\rho^2)(\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2 + \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2) - 4\rho \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle \langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle \right\}$$

$$\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}\|^2 - \|\hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}^0\|^2 = \frac{1}{n^2(1-\rho^2)^2} \left\{ (1+\rho^2)(\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2 + \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2) - 4\rho \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle \langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle \right\} - \frac{1}{n^2} (\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2 + \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2)$$

$$= \frac{1}{n^2} (\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2 + \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2) \left\{ \frac{(1+\rho^2)}{(1-\rho^2)^2} - 1 \right\} - \frac{4\rho}{n^2(1-\rho^2)^2} \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle \langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle \stackrel{\text{Let}}{\geq} 0$$

$$\Rightarrow (\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2 + \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2) \{ (1+\rho^2) - (1-\rho^2)^2 \} - 4\rho \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle \langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle \geq 0$$

$$\Rightarrow (\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2 + \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2) \{ 3\rho^2 - \rho^4 \} - 4\rho \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle \langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle \geq 0$$

$$\Rightarrow (\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2 + \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2) (3\rho - \rho^3) - 4\rho \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle \langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle \geq 0$$

$$\Rightarrow (3\rho - \rho^3) \geq \frac{4\rho \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle \langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle}{(\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2 + \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2)}$$

$$\Rightarrow \rho^3 - 3\rho + \frac{4\rho \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle \langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle}{(\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2 + \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2)} \leq 0$$

The roots of this cubic function are:

$$a = 2 \cos\left(\frac{\cos^{-1}(-d/2)}{3}\right), b = 2 \cos\left(\frac{\cos^{-1}(-d/2) + 2\pi}{3}\right), c = 2 \cos\left(\frac{\cos^{-1}(-d/2) - 2\pi}{3}\right)$$

$$\text{where } d = \frac{4\langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle \langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle}{(\langle \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2 + \langle \mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{y} \rangle^2)}$$

Thus, if the order of a, b, c is $a > b > c$, the condition of ρ s.t. $\|\hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}^0\|^2 \leq \|\hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}\|^2$ is the intersection of $\{-1 < \rho < 1\}$ and $\{\rho < c \text{ or } b < \rho < a\}$.